

14 September 2022

Paul Feiner, Town Supervisor Town of Greenburgh 177 Hillside Avenue Greenburgh, NY 10607 pfeiner@greenburghny.com

Sent via email

Dear Paul Feiner,

As an organization dedicated to advocating for the protections of the First Amendment, we are concerned to learn of your calls to remove the depiction of Minister Louis Farrakhan, and potentially other public figures deemed "controversial," from a new town-commissioned mural, painted by the artist known as Kindo Art, in collaboration with other artists, activists, and Town Committees. These demands have serious implications for freedom of expression. We urge you to rescind these calls for erasure and allow the uninterrupted completion of the mural as originally agreed and budgeted.

As we understand it, the mural—initially commissioned to allow due artistic license of Kindo Art—was to represent Black History, including the Civil Rights Movement, in the United States. Original good faith requests by the Town to avoid depictions of violence, sexuality, and hate speech in the mural have been respected, and the mural planning has undergone over two years of planning and cooperative review. The resulting project, which is to date half-completed, is true to these blueprints, and illustrates over twenty figures, past and present, who have contributed to Black culture and political life. To get to this stage, the artwork has undergone two key reviews, which included the approval of an initial rough sketch, and the approval of the painted mural, which included a completed depiction of Minister Farrakhan. These approvals preceded the second of three contracted payments to Kindo Art, and your subsequent calls to censor the mural.

To dictate who can and cannot be represented in the mural does a disservice to the project's original intentions of celebrating Black voices, contributions, and histories by attempting to assert control over them. Practically every public figure has the ability to invoke different associations and take on divergent meanings to individuals across a heterogeneous and democratic society. Similarly, a close reading into the history of any movement of liberation often reveals contributors at odds with one another. Dissent is an important, and importantly messy, part of democracy.

We understand your responsibility as an elected official is in part to represent the interests of your constituency. However, your constituency is not limited to those who

NCAC PARTICIPATING ORGANIZATIONS

Actors' Equity Association AICA-USA American Association of School Administrators American Association of University Professors American Association of University Women American Booksellers for Free Expression American Civil Liberties Union American Ethical Union American Federation of Teachers American Jewish Committee American Library Association American Literary Translators Association American Society of Journalists & Authors Americans United for Separation of Church & State Association of American Publishers Authors Guild Catholics for Choice Children's Literature Association College Art Association Comic Book Legal Defense Fund The Creative Coalition Directors Guild of America The Dramatists Guild of America Dramatists Legal Defense Fund Educational Book & Media Association First Amendment Lawyers Association Free Speech Coalition Freedom to Read Foundation Global Alliance for Behavioral Health and Social Justice International Literacy Association Lambda Legal Modern Language Association National Center for Science Education National Communication Association National Council for the Social Studies National Council of the Churches National Council of Jewish Women National Council of Teachers of English National Education Association National Youth Rights Association The NewsGuild-CWA PEN America People For the American Way Planned Parenthood Federation of America Project Censored SAG-AFTRA Sexuality Information & Education Council of the U.S. Society of Children's Book Writers & Illustrators Student Press Law Center Union for Reform Judaism Union of Democratic Intellectuals Unitarian Universalist Association United Church of Christ Office of Communication United Methodist Church, United Methodist Communications Women's American ORT

Woodhull Sexual Freedom Alliance

Writers Guild of America, East

Writers Guild of America, West

have vocalized their disapproval of the mural. It also includes those who celebrate every square foot of it.

Indeed, while some may associate the representation of Minister Farrakhan with his anti-Semitic, anti-white, or anti-LGBTQ sentiments, others may connote it with a focus on uplifting and defending the Black community, or with his involvement in a particular time and place, as with 1995's Million Man March—an event that aimed to push back against racial stereotyping of Black men by encouraging support and self-sufficiency within the Black community. Respecting diversity of perspective does not mean suppressing everything that could potentially generate an objection.

Your demands as Town Supervisor appear to be based on subjective interpretations and individual complaints, which is concerning to us. The practice of public officials using their power to arbitrarily remove elements of an artwork whose message some individuals do not like violates principles of free expression. Government should not force an artist, who has been expressly selected to create a public installation, to modify their message in order to satisfy individual complaints. In effect, you give power to hecklers and embolden them for future disputes.

It's important to remember that conflicts of artistic intention and audience interpretation are not uncommon in art: by its nature art is open to multiple readings which are informed by personal experience and perspective. However, there is a serious problem when one interpretation is privileged by those in power and becomes the reason to censor public artwork.

Instead of removing controversial material we encourage the Town of Greenburgh to contextualize the artwork and make clear the intentions of the artists and collaborators of the project, which may indeed include educational context regarding more fraught figures in the planned QR codes, or public discussions. We also strongly encourage the Town of Greenburgh to enact a policy for the selection of public art, and procedures for reviewing and responding to complaints that are consistent with principles of free expression. We stand ready to offer assistance as needed.

Sincerely,

Christopher Finan Executive Director

CC: Judith Beville, Greenburgh Town Clerk

Ellen Hendrickx, Greenburgh Town Councilwoman

Gina Jackson, Greenburgh Town Councilwoman

Ken Jones, Greenburgh Town Councilman

Francis Sheehan, Greenburgh Town Councilman

Hudson Valley NYCLU

Kindo Art

Clifton Abrams. Black Lives Matter Mural Committee

NCAC.ORG